

Philosophical Perspectives on Modern Marketing: An Analysis of Post-Covid-19 Dynamics and Strategic Adaptations

799

Afif Hadi Susanto

Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia
E-Mail: afifhadi8@gmail.com

Mugi Harsono

Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia
E-Mail: mugiharsono_fe@staff.uns.ac.id

Submitted:
12 JUNE 2023

Accepted:
21 NOVEMBER 2023

ABSTRACT

This article employs a philosophical study of science to comprehensively examine the transformations in marketing behavior patterns triggered by the global impact of Covid-19. It integrates the dimensions of ontology, epistemology, and axiology to explore post-pandemic marketing dynamics. The research elucidates shifts in market realities and consumer experiences before and after the pandemic, exploring the mechanisms underlying these changes and providing insights into the evolving landscape of modern marketing. Emphasizing the imperative for organizations to continually reassess and adapt their strategies, the study underscores the importance of understanding the epistemological foundations of marketing paradigm shifts. Remaining attuned to market trends and technological advancements is deemed critical for relevance in the post-Covid-19 landscape. The research also highlights the significance of aligning modern marketing with consumer values in the “new normal,” urging organizations to integrate these values into their strategies for mutual benefits. This study offers valuable insights for organizations navigating and capitalizing on the evolving dynamics of marketing in the post-Covid-19 era.

Keywords: Modern marketing, Market changes post Covid-19, Ontology, Epistemology, Axiology

ABSTRAK

Artikel ini menggunakan studi filosofis ilmu pengetahuan untuk secara komprehensif menguji transformasi pola perilaku pemasaran yang dipicu oleh dampak global Covid-19. Ini mengintegrasikan dimensi ontologi, epistemologi, dan aksiologi untuk mengeksplorasi dinamika pemasaran pasca pandemi. Penelitian ini menjelaskan pergeseran dalam realitas pasar dan pengalaman konsumen sebelum dan sesudah pandemi, mengeksplorasi mekanisme di balik perubahan tersebut, dan memberikan wawasan tentang perkembangan lanskap pemasaran modern. Dengan menekankan pentingnya bagi organisasi untuk terus menilai dan menyesuaikan strategi mereka, penelitian ini menegaskan betapa pentingnya memahami dasar-dasar epistemologi pergeseran paradigma pemasaran. Tetap berada dalam tren pasar dan kemajuan teknologi dianggap kritis untuk relevansi dalam lanskap pasca pandemi Covid-19. Penelitian ini juga menyoroti pentingnya menyelaraskan pemasaran modern dengan nilai konsumen dalam “normal baru”, mendorong organisasi untuk mengintegrasikan nilai-nilai ini ke dalam strategi mereka untuk saling keuntungan. Studi ini memberikan wawasan berharga bagi organisasi yang berusaha menavigasi dan memanfaatkan dinamika yang berkembang dalam pemasaran di era pasca pandemi Covid-19.

Kata kunci: Pemasaran modern, Perubahan pasar pasca Covid-19, Ontologi, Epistemologi, Aksiologi

JIMKES

Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen
Kesatuan
Vol. 11 No. 3, 2023
pp. 799-806
STIE Kesatuan
ISSN 2337 – 7860

INTRODUCTION

Philosophy is an attempt to find out the truth and wisdom of an event. Philosophy is a scientific discipline that seeks to provide explanations and explore fundamental questions about existence, knowledge, ethics, reality and various other aspects that underlie human understanding of the world and life (Bloom & Kirsch, 1968). Philosophy of science is then seen as a sub-discipline of philosophy that specifically focuses on questions related to science and scientific methods (Obi-Okogbuo & Hons, 2015). The philosophy of science has become an arena for various discussions, speculation and intellectual research that have shaped the way we view the world and science itself. Through the views of experts throughout history, we can explore the development of events that occurred and explain them in a coherent and clear manner (Hempel & Oppenheim, 1948). Kuhn (2012) in his book entitled “The Structure of Scientific Revolutions” explains that the philosophy of science is a study that provides an explanation of paradigm changes in science that develop and change over time.

Companies need to consider the ethics of sustainable innovation in developing new products and services. Innovations must have clear and positive benefits for consumers and society as a whole. Marketing adjustments and innovations must be dynamic and have a sustainable impact. Marketers must make adjustments in relation to external environmental conditions. The main focus that can be seen is the trend of needs, desires and expectations of certain market segments. Businesspeople, especially marketers, must understand this. This understanding is key to maintaining business continuity both during and after the Covid-19 pandemic. Digital transformation is related to the application of internet-based information technology such as social media, websites and e-commerce applications. The use of digital marketing as an integral part of an e-business strategy is important for business actors. Marketers must understand the conditions and adapt to the scale of the business and industry they are involved in (Puspita et al., 2021).

This article aims to look at the developments that emerged from marketing behavior patterns after Covid-19 occurred throughout the world, using a study of the philosophy of science. Marketing is defined as a social and managerial process for creating valuable product offerings that other people need or want (Kotler et al., 2015). The bidding process carried out will certainly experience changes in line with developments over time. Marketing should not only focus on existing products or marketing methods, but should focus more on customer needs and desires (Levitt, 1960). The Covid-19 pandemic not only provides new challenges for the world of marketing, but also opens up new opportunities. Companies that can adapt quickly, respond to changing consumer behavior and understand current market dynamics have the opportunity to survive and grow in this ever-changing environment.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research uses a literature study approach, to gain insight into the dynamics of modern marketing post-Covid-19. The chosen methodology involves data collection through an in-depth search for relevant information and data derived from previous research. To ensure a thorough exploration of the academic landscape. The focus of this study is the transformative impact of the Covid-19 pandemic on marketing practices, emphasizing key aspects such as consumer behavior and digital marketing strategies. By leveraging specific keywords – “marketing,” “post-Covid-19,” “consumer behavior” and “digital marketing” – the researchers aimed to identify and analyze a diverse range of studies that provide valuable insights into the world’s evolving landscape. marketing after the global health crisis. This systematic approach to data collection ensures that the research is based on a comprehensive understanding of contemporary marketing trends and strategies, thereby enabling the formulation of appropriate conclusions and recommendations. This research adopts a literature study methodology with a special focus on post-Covid-19 marketing dynamics shaped by the pandemic.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Transformation is described as a shift between eras. Technology-driven electronic communication and transaction methods help and accelerate the ongoing transformation of the times (Young, 1999). Most aspects of life will be affected by the transformation of the times, the main discussion that will be discussed in this article is developments that occur in marketing. Firat & Dholakia (2006) explains that modern marketing as we know it today found its identity in the second half of the 20th century. In this period, the basic principles of modern marketing and its role in society began to take shape. The digital revolution began to change marketing, the emergence of the internet and digital technology opened up new opportunities for advertising, data collection and interaction with customers. Marketing is changing shape and continues to metamorphose into new configurations and forms as a result of fundamental technological revolutions and in the face of the continuing effects of the recession. Consumers now have more influence and control over the marketing process (Kitchen & Proctor, 2015).

Modern marketing is defined as a form of marketing that follows the current patterns of the times. Technology is an important aspect in changing marketing patterns in the current modern era. Needs and desires are the main orientation of marketing patterns, and Covid-19 has certainly changed marketing patterns significantly. The digitalization process is forced to move more quickly due to health demands and limited community mobility. Modern marketing follows the changes that occur and adapts to the conditions needed to be able to adapt and survive in market competition.

The discussion related to the philosophy of science will begin by looking at aspects of ontology. Ontology is a branch of philosophy that discusses the nature of existence, reality, and what can be considered to “exist.” It tries to answer fundamental questions about what really exists, how we can understand existence, and what the relationships are between different objects or entities in the world (Aristotle, 1933). In this discussion, ontology in the philosophy of science will be used to explain what changes have occurred in marketing after Covid-19.

The Covid-19 pandemic has changed market realities in significant ways. The ontology in the context that will be discussed in this article involves the question of what changes have occurred in markets and consumer behavior as a result of the pandemic. Are markets seen as more volatile and uncertain, or is there a new concept of “normal” in the post-pandemic marketing reality (Rauter et al., 2019). Several studies provide evidence of changes to market realities that have occurred. Wang et al. (2020) in their research explains that the Covid-19 crisis has deeply affected the transformation of the global economy and threatened the survival of companies around the world. The study conducted explored how companies in China develop their marketing strategies by identifying critical conditions and then carrying out corporate marketing innovations using two dimensions, namely motivation for innovation and the level of collaborative innovation. Companies are forced to change following necessary conditions. A study conducted by He & Harris (2020) also provides evidence of this link to changing market realities. Business continuity will depend on their ability to treat the Covid-19 situation as a turning point. Based on a deep understanding of changes in consumer psychology and behavior during home isolation, many retailers and even some leading manufacturers are choosing to use live e-commerce as a new channel that can adapt to home quarantine policies and make it more convenient for consumers to get access to products or services they need (Griffiths et al., 2021).

With the existence of e-commerce and consumer behavior who now enjoy shopping online, the reach of online marketing is becoming increasingly wider (Hu & Zhang, 2021). If a comparison is taken from before the pandemic, marketing using advertising only reached urban communities close to shopping centers. Even though there is online marketing, people in rural areas are still unfamiliar with digital media. But now, after the pandemic, rural communities are also familiar with online shopping. Thus, the marketing

reach of a product has spread wider. Supported by various social media nowadays which supports the distribution of product marketing advertisements.

These changes, which were initially forced, continue to be adopted and used today, this occurs because of changes in behavior that occur among consumers and habits that begin to form. Kim (2020) explains that the pandemic forced workplace operations to go virtual and many businesses have successfully made the transition in a short time. Digital marketing methods are used to maintain the company's existence. Normalization of digitalization is carried out because changes are forced and fast. Through the explanation that has been carried out, it can be seen that through the ontology aspect, the market and consumer behavior have changed as a result of the pandemic.

The ontology also includes changes in consumer experience. How individuals experience interactions with brands, products and services in an environment impacted by the pandemic. Jo et al. (2021) in his research explains that the number of credit and debit card transactions for online purchases has increased gradually since the emergence of Covid-19 in Korea and throughout the world. This change occurred as a sign of a shift from shopping in conventional stores to purchasing online for food items and daily necessities. These temporary changes are having a lasting impact on consumer purchasing patterns post-Covid-19. People are starting to get used to online purchases using debit or credit transactions. Maryati (2020) in her research also explains that consumer behavior has changed during the pandemic, people feel comfortable with new habits during the pandemic. This incident occurred because people felt the benefits and tended to continue this new habit during the post-pandemic or "new normal". During the pandemic, people have a habit of buying or consuming basic necessities online, starting from buying rice, household appliances and even vegetables and fruit that can be purchased online.

This ease in shopping makes consumers more impulsive compared to before Covid-19. Apart from basic needs, they are starting to buy additional needs such as goods to channel their hobbies and gain pleasure through digital media. This happened because during the pandemic, one of the 'entertainments' for them to fill their free time was shopping online. On the other hand, consumers now also get a new experience from shopping online, namely writing reviews. Reviews in online shopping have quite a big influence on the image of a company and on consumer trust. Compared to before Covid-19, consumers who shop offline if they find the product is not good, they will only tell the people closest to them, but now they can provide reviews on a product directly which will spread much more widely to other consumers. Consumer purchasing experiences have changed due to activities usually carried out during the pandemic, resulting in the formation of new habits in people's consumption patterns which are called the "new normal".

Epistemology is an aspect of scientific philosophy with the aim of understanding how our process of understanding and acquiring knowledge works. Epistemology is concerned with the way we think, learn, and organize ideas (Bloom & Kirsch, 1968). In simple terms, epistemology is used as an aspect of the philosophy of science to find out how we know about something, how we can be sure about something and what makes information valid knowledge. In this epistemology article, we will photograph the changing paradigm of modern marketing after Covid-19 and provide an explanation of how the changes occurred.

Modern marketing post Covid-19 provides a change in the knowledge paradigm in this industry. Initially marketing strategies were based on historical data and long-term trends. However, the pandemic provides a significant pattern of change because conditions force it to change. The changes that are taking place raise epistemological questions about how we understand, measure, and apply knowledge in new marketing contexts. Kim (2020) explains that knowledge moves quickly and uncontrollably, changes in knowledge can occur due to various phenomena that underlie these changes. The pandemic is considered an accelerator of structural changes in consumption and digital transformation in markets. Society has a new alternative understanding of consumption and purchasing patterns in the market (Narayan et al., 2021). Marketers who were initially accustomed to designing

strategies based on historical data are forced to be more flexible and responsive to current conditions. He & Harris (2020) revealed the occurrence of a “paradigm shift” or what could be called a paradigm shift. New knowledge emerges to replace old changes about modern marketing.

Modern marketing is increasingly focused on digital experiences. Conditions force digitalization to move more quickly due to the limitations that occurred when Covid-19 hit the entire world (Kim, 2020). Businesses must be responsive to changes that occur with digitalization in the form of optimizing websites and developing attractive digital content (Cruz-Cárdenas et al., 2021). Some of these include the use of social media, video content and mobile applications to interact with customers. Companies are required to be more interactive with the digital experiences received by consumers (Almeida et al., 2020).

Conditions that have never been encountered before mean that various changes must be made quickly and precisely. Previous marketing paradigms may have been based on stable, long-term strategies. Post Covid-19, companies must be more flexible, adaptive and ready to respond quickly to market changes. This requires regular updating of marketing strategies (Yap et al., 2021). After Covid-19, data has become a very valuable source of information for companies. Companies must carefully collect customer data and then carry out analysis and use it as a basis for smarter decisions about targeting and personalizing marketing campaigns (Just & Echaust, 2020).

Consumers are starting to pay attention to the health and safety of the products they buy. Therefore, companies should highlight the hygiene and safety measures they take in their marketing. This applies especially to businesses involved in direct service to customers. Covid-19 provides a new paradigm shift in today’s modern marketing processes. Change arises due to unexpected changes in conditions experienced by communities throughout the world (Berg et al., 2021). Axiology in Modern Marketing after Covid-19, The axiological aspect is seen as an aspect to see the usefulness or benefits of something. This article provides a final overview regarding the phenomenon that is occurring, namely Covid-19, which is changing many aspects of life. The pandemic has changed the way companies interact with customers, develop products, design strategies and deliver marketing messages.

Following are some aspects of axiology that are relevant in the context of modern marketing post Covid-19. Axiology in modern marketing after Covid-19 includes strategy and ethics in handling crises. How organizations assess and execute their social responsibilities during a global health crisis and how values and ethics are integrated into modern marketing policies and practices. Fraser-Arnott (2023) explains that the crisis event due to the pandemic that occurred provided new experiences about conditions that might occur. Companies need to learn to start predicting various possible events that will occur in the future. The possibility of loss can be minimized with flexibility and responsive handling of all conditions. Almansour (2022) explains that the problems that arise in operations due to the pandemic provide an explanation that any possibility can arise. A crisis can test the integrity and reputation of an organization. Therefore, correct strategy and ethics are very important in handling a crisis. By planning well, communicating honestly, and acting with integrity, an organization can better navigate a crisis and minimize its negative impacts. Crises have the potential to test the integrity and image of an organization. Therefore, it is very important to pay attention to appropriate strategies and ethical principles when dealing with crisis situations. By planning carefully, communicating openly and honestly, and carrying out actions with integrity, organizations can more effectively overcome crises and reduce the negative impacts that may arise.

Lastly, we discuss modern marketing in relation to the study of the philosophy of science, changes do occur and cover various aspects. In this research it is explained in Figure 1.



Figure 1. Model of philosophical study of modern marketing science

The research, as depicted in Figure 1, underscores the significance of delving into the philosophy of science, particularly the study of ontology, epistemology, and axiology, to elucidate the transformative shifts witnessed in modern marketing post-Covid-19. The ontological aspect of the philosophy of science is employed to elucidate the nature of changes that have transpired in marketing paradigms. By employing ontology, the research aims to offer a profound understanding of the altered market reality post-pandemic, substantiated by empirical evidence derived from prior research endeavors. This entails a comprehensive exploration of how the very essence of the market has evolved, encompassing alterations in consumer behaviors and experiences.

The epistemological facet of the philosophy of science serves as a critical lens to scrutinize how knowledge about the post-Covid-19 marketing landscape is acquired. In this context, the research functions as a source of knowledge, elucidating the paradigmatic shift in modern marketing processes brought about by the Covid-19 pandemic. By drawing on accredited and reliable references, the study establishes a foundation for understanding the mechanisms through which knowledge is generated regarding the transformative effects of the pandemic on marketing strategies.

Furthermore, the axiological aspect is invoked to assess the inherent value and benefits arising from the post-Covid-19 marketing landscape. The research scrutinizes the practical advantages that marketers derive from the paradigm shift induced by the pandemic. This includes an exploration of strategies and ethical considerations in navigating crises and fostering sustainable innovation. The axiological analysis serves to highlight the utility and positive outcomes stemming from the changes in marketing practices, emphasizing the adaptive strategies that enable marketers to navigate rapidly evolving conditions effectively. In essence, the research leverages the philosophy of science, encompassing ontology, epistemology, and axiology, to provide a holistic and deepened understanding of the profound changes in modern marketing post-Covid-19. Through this multidimensional approach, the study contributes valuable insights into the altered market dynamics, knowledge acquisition processes, and the inherent benefits that have emerged for marketers in the wake of the global pandemic.

CONCLUSION

This research has explained in more depth modern marketing after Covid-19 from the perspective of ontology, epistemology and axiology. Through the ontology aspect, it has explained changes in market realities and consumer experiences between before and after the pandemic. Then it is explained in epistemology how these changes can occur, and finally in the axiological aspect it is explained how modern marketing can provide beneficial value to the changes that have occurred after Covid-19. The implication of post-Covid-19 marketing ontology analysis is a deep understanding of changes in market realities and consumer experiences. The changes that occur indicate that companies must continue to review and adapt marketing strategies to keep up with changes. The changes described in this aspect of ontology can influence the way products are positioned and how consumers interact with brands. Through understanding the epistemology of marketing paradigm changes, organizations can identify the causes of these changes and

design more responsive strategies. It is important to be able to always monitor market trends, technology and consumer behavior to remain relevant to the strategies implemented. Organizations that can accommodate and understand the changing dynamics of marketing will have a better chance of adapting quickly. From an axiological perspective, the main implication is how modern marketing can provide beneficial value to the changes that occur after Covid-19. Organizations need to understand the values valued by consumers in the “new normal” context and integrate them into the marketing strategies implemented. An effective marketing axiology not only understands these values but can also convey them through the creation of mutual benefits between the company and consumers.

REFERENCES

- [1] Almansour, M. (2022). Food start-ups: leveraging digital marketing and disruptive information systems innovations to survive in the post-COVID environment. *European Journal of Innovation Management*, ahead - of - p (ahead-of-print). <https://doi.org/10.1108/EJIM-07-2022-0370>
- [2] Almeida, F., Duarte Santos, J., & Augusto Monteiro, J. (2020). The Challenges and Opportunities in the Digitalization of Companies in a Post-COVID-19 World. *IEEE Engineering Management Review*, 48 (3), 97–103. <https://doi.org/10.1109/EMR.2020.3013206>
- [3] Aristotle. (1933). *Metaphysics* (Vol. 1). Harvard University Press Cambridge, MA.
- [4] Berg, S.H., O'Hara, J.K., Shortt, M.T., Thune, H., Brønnick, K.K., Lungu, D.A., Røislien, J., & Wiig, S. (2021). Health authorities' health risk communication with the public during pandemics: a rapid scoping review. *BMC Public Health*, 21 (1), 1401. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-021-11468-3>
- [5] Bloom, A., & Kirsch, A. (1968). *The republic of Plato*. New York: Basic Books.
- [6] Cruz-Cárdenas, J., Zabelina, E., Guadalupe-Lanas, J., Palacio-Fierro, A., & Ramos-Galarza, C. (2021). COVID-19, consumer behavior, technology, and society: A literature review and bibliometric analysis. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 173, 121179. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2021.121179>
- [7] Firat, A. F., & Dholakia, N. (2006). Theoretical and philosophical implications of postmodern debates: Some challenges to modern marketing. *In Marketing Theory* 6, (2). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1470593106063981>
- [8] Fraser-Arnott, M. (2023). Academic library marketing in the post-COVID world. *The Journal of Academic Librarianship*, 49 (4), 102744. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.acalib.2023.102744>
- [9] Griffiths, S., Furszyfer Del Rio, D., & Sovacool, B. (2021). Policy mixes to achieve sustainable mobility after the COVID-19 crisis. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 143, 110919. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2021.110919>
- [10] He, H., & Harris, L. (2020). The impact of Covid-19 pandemic on corporate social responsibility and marketing philosophy. *Journal of Business Research*, 116 (4), 176–182. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2020.05.030>
- [11] Hempel, C. G., & Oppenheim, P. (1948). Studies in the Logic of Explanation. *Philosophy of Science*, 15 (2), 135–175. <https://doi.org/10.1086/286983>
- [12] Hu, S., & Zhang, Y. (2021). COVID-19 pandemic and firm performance: Cross-country evidence. *International Review of Economics and Finance*, 74 (2020), 365–372. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iref.2021.03.016>
- [13] Jo, H., Shin, E., & Kim, H. (2021). Changes in consumer behavior in the post-COVID-19 era in Seoul, South Korea. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 13 (1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13010136>
- [14] Just, M., & Echaust, K. (2020). Stock market returns, volatility, correlation and liquidity during the COVID-19 crisis: Evidence from the Markov switching approach. *Finance Research Letters*, 37 (September), 101775. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.frl.2020.101775>
- [15] Kim, R.Y. (2020). The Impact of COVID-19 on Consumers: Preparing for Digital Sales. *IEEE Engineering Management Review*, 48 (3), 212–218. <https://doi.org/10.1109/EMR.2020.2990115>
- [16] Kim, R.Y. (2020b). The Impact of COVID-19 on Consumers: Preparing for Digital Sales. *IEEE Engineering Management Review*, 48 (3), 212–218. <https://doi.org/10.1109/EMR.2020.2990115>
- [17] Kitchen, P. J., & Proctor, T. (2015). Marketing communications in a post-modern world. *Journal of Business Strategy*, 36 (5), 34–42. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JBS-06-2014-0070>
- [18] Kotler, P., Burton, S., Deans, K., Brown, L., & Armstrong, G. (2015). *Marketing*. Pearson Higher Education AU.
- [19] Kuhn, T. S. (2012). *The structure of scientific revolutions*. University of Chicago press.
- [20] Levitt, T. (1960). Marketing Myopia. *Marketing and the Library*, 59–80. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315860145-5>

- [21] Narayan, P.K., Phan, D.H.B., & Liu, G. (2021). COVID-19 lockdowns, stimulus packages, travel bans, and stock returns. *Finance Research Letters*, 38 (August 2020), 101732. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.frl.2020.101732>
- [22] Obi-Okogbuo, J., & Hons, B. P. (2015). the Philosophy of Science. a Delineation of Its Scope and Boundaries. *European Scientific Journal*, 11 (8), 130–140.
- [23] Puspita, V., Safrianti, S., Donovan, I., Sari, PM, Hidayati, A., Akhir, AFP, & Hayadi, BH (2021). Optimization of Digital Marketing Integration Through the Role of the Millennial Generation as MSMEs Effort To Survive During The Covid-19 Pandemic. 2021 9th International Conference on Cyber and IT Service Management (CITSM), 1–5. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CITSM52892.2021.9588857>
- [24] Rauter, R., Globocnik, D., Perl-Vorbach, E., & Baumgartner, R. J. (2019). Open innovation and its effects on economic and sustainable innovation performance. *Journal of Innovation and Knowledge*, 4 (4), 226–233. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jik.2018.03.004>
- [25] Tati Maryati. (2020). Consumer Behavior Changes Post Covid-19 Pandemic. *International Journal of Halal Research*, 2 (2), 84–89. www.accenture.com
- [26] Wang, Y., Hong, A., Li, X., & Gao, J. (2020). Marketing innovations during a global crisis: A study of China firms' response to COVID-19. *Journal of Business Research*, 116, 214–220. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2020.05.029>
- [27] Yap, S.F., Xu, Y., & Tan, L.P. (2021). Coping with crisis: The paradox of technology and consumer vulnerability. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 45 (6), 1239–1257. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijcs.12724>
- [28] Young, L. (1999). Marketing the Modern: Department Stores, Consumer Culture, and the New Middle Class in Interwar Japan. *International Labor and Working-Class History*, 55 (55), 52–70. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S014754799900318X>